

## **MINUTES OF PUBLIC OPENING OF FINANCIAL PROPOSALS (Concurrent and Ex-Post Program Evaluations-Consultancy)**

1. Financial evaluation committee meeting was held on 3<sup>rd</sup> August, 2022 (2.30 PM) in the conference hall of IDP project under the Chairmanship of Sh. Dharamveer Meena, IFS, Executive Director IDP- Solan
2. The following Committee members were present in the meeting:-
  - i. Sh. T. Venkatesan, IFS, Dy. Director (Planning)
  - ii. Sh. H.K. Sharma, Dy. Director (Admin.), IDP, Solan
  - iii. Sh. Baneshwar Singh, SMS (M&E), IDP, Solan
  - iv. Sh. Aman Sharma, SMS (Agribusiness), IDP, Solan.

The representatives of the firms were also present in the public opening of financial proposals (M&E):

1. Dr. J. N. Raina, Concurrent Expert, WAPCOS Ltd.
2. Dr. K.P.S. Malik, Team Leader, WAPCOS Ltd.
3. Dr. Abhishek Samal, Sutra Consulting Pvt. Ltd.
4. Dr. Liju. V.J. Associate Director PWC Pvt. Ltd.
5. A.K. Thakur Consultant, PWC Pvt. Ltd.

The members present in the Financial Proposal opening for Concurrent and Ex-post Program Evaluation consultancy, were welcomed by the Chairman and briefed about the financial opening of proposals and evaluation.

3. The following three (3) firms had qualified for the financial evaluation stage based on minimum qualifying criteria for the technical evaluation (above 75 marks).
  - i) PricewaterhouseCooper Pvt. Ltd. Gurgaon, Haryana
  - ii) Sutra Consulting Pvt. Ltd. Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar
  - iii) WAPCOS Ltd, KAILASH, 5<sup>TH</sup> Floor, KG Marg, New Delhi
4. The financial proposals of the qualifying firms were opened by the evaluation Committee one by one in the presence of representatives of the firms, after due verification of sealed cover.

The financial rates quoted by the firms are given as below:

Name of Firm	Total Amount (INR)	Fin. Value (INR)	GST (18%) (INR)
PWC Pvt. Ltd.	5,60,51,888	4,75,01,600	85,50,288
Sutra Consulting Pvt. Ltd.	5,11,86,040	4,33,78,000	78,08,040
WAPCOS Ltd.	3,49,39,800	2,96,10,000	53,29,800

5. The rates quoted by the shortlisted firms were read out by the Member Secretary of the Committee, one by one in the presence of representatives of the firms.
6. After evaluation of the financial proposals submitted by the consultants, the proposal of the WAPCOS Ltd. was found to be lowest.
7. To find out Most Adventitious Firm for the Concurrent and Ex-Post Program Evaluations- Consultancy based on Quality Cost Based Selection (QCBS), further calculations were done as per the methodology described in ITC Data sheet (27.1) in the issued RFP.
8. On the basis of Quality Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method, the WAPCOS Ltd. - Consultancy firm was found to be Most Adventitious firms for the Concurrent and Ex-Post Program Evaluations- Consultancy.
9. Recommendations of the Financial Committee are enclosed herewith the minutes of opening & evaluation of financial proposals.

(Sh T.Venkatesan, IFS)  
Dy. Dir. Planning  
Member

(Sh. H.K. Sharma)  
Dy. Dir. Admin.  
Member Secretary

(Aman Sharma)  
SMS Agribusiness  
Member

(Baneshwar Singh)  
SMS M&E  
Member

(Sh. Dharamveer Meena, IFS)  
**Chairman**  
Executive Director-IDP-Solan